Name of Writer:

Name of Reviewer:

Guided Peer Review

Read the essay, slowly and thoroughly.

Now, set it aside (that is, don’t look at it), and answer the following: What do you think is the main argument of this paper?

Now, you can take up the essay and look at it again. Is the main idea clearly and completely articulated in the introduction? If yes, underline the sentence in the paper, and write “thesis?” next to it in the margin. If no, explain below why it’s unclear.

Does each paragraph contain a claim (a main idea) that helps to prove the thesis statement? In the margin of each paragraph of the paper, write either “claim: yes” or “claim: no.” Below, describe the problem you see with any paragraph that doesn’t help to prove the thesis statement.

Does each paragraph contain evidence (in the form of quotations or direct references to the texts) to help prove its claim? In the margin of each paragraph of the paper, write either “evidence: yes” or “evidence: no.” Below, describe any problems you see in paragraphs that are lacking adequate support/evidence.

Is each quotation in the paper clearly and completely interpreted and linked to the main idea? In the margin of each paragraph of the paper, write either “interpretation: yes” or “interpretation: no.” Below, describe any problems you see in paragraphs that give quotations but don’t explain them clearly.

Now, re-read the entire paper a second time. Then, put it aside (that is, don’t look at it), and answer the following question: How does the argument unfold in the essay? In other words, how is the paper organized?

Now, you can take up the essay and look at it again. Do any paragraphs seem out of place, either off-topic, or on-topic but in a confusing place? In the paper, circle any off-topic or confusing paragraphs. Below, explain what you think is wrong with them.

Is each paragraph unified by one main idea? Or do some paragraphs jump around and meander from topic to topic? Below, explain the main idea of the clearest paragraph of the essay. Then, explain the problem with the most confusing paragraph of the essay.

Are the quotations introduced in a smooth, controlled way? Or are they simply dropped in as separate sentences, or introduced awkwardly? In the paper, underline any awkwardly or abruptly introduced quotations. Below, give some suggestions for incorporating the quotations more smoothly.

Finally, what is the best aspect of this paper? What one aspect needs the most improvement?